



Bi-annual Member Meeting Minutes

Date: Wednesday 27 July 2022

Time: 16:00-17:30 HKT

Location: Zoom & Live at KIN Food Halls

Attendees:

27 individuals, representing:

17	Members	1	Technical Advisor
3	Observers	5	Steering Committee members
1	Secretariat	0	Independent consultants

Agenda

Section	Time (pm)	Item	Lead
Introduction	4:00 - 4:05	Housekeeping	Jacqui
	4:05 - 4:10	Welcome remarks and HKSSC Vision	Ben
2022 updates	4:10 - 4:30	Membership updates New member Secretariat change Member survey updates	Jacqui Tasting Kitchen Mandy Wong Jacqui
Working Group progress	4:30 – 4:50	Seafood Risk Assessment Outreach & Comms (World Ocean Day campaign results) (Minderoo Foundation policy research) Marketplace	<u>WG leads:</u> Cesar Makiko Makiko / Jacqui Jacqui Cesar / George
External speakers	4:50 – 5:05	Global Dialogue on Seafood Traceability and digitization Biodiversity Beyond National Jurisdiction (BBNJ) campaign	Maggie Lee Oliver Tanqueray (SSC, UK)
Funding and fees	5:05 – 5:15	Update on fee collection Implementation of payment hiatus Secretariat for 2023	Sophie
AOB	5:15 – 5:30	News and resources and AOB	Jacqui and All
Networking session	5:45 onwards	Social event at KIN Food Halls (Prof. Yvonne Sadovy as speaker)	All



1. Housekeeping

- Reminder of Chatham house rules and transparency of meeting minutes.

2. Welcome remarks

- Benjamin So, the Chairperson of the HKSSC, also the Founder of 178 Degrees delivered a welcome remark and an overview of the work in HKSSC in the past six months.

3. HKSSC Vision

- Reiteration of the vision, mission and values of the HKSSC.
- The vision of HKSSC is for all seafood imported into Hong Kong to be legal, traceable and biologically sustainable.
- Its mission is to encourage members to commit to improving their sourcing practices, and also the whole seafood industry to improve.
- Its work is based on the values of promoting traceability, transparency, engagement and due diligence.

4. Membership Updates

- Currently HKSSC has 17 members, which comprise *8 suppliers* (178 Degrees, Eat the Kiwi, Indoguna Lordly, M&C Asia, Pacific Rich Resources, Food Origin, Natural Holland and Saga Seafood Ltd.), *3 catering groups* (Hong Kong Personal Chef, Relish Kitchen and KIN Food Halls), *4 hotel/casino groups* (Hongkong and Shanghai Hotels, Sands China Ltd., Mandarin Oriental Hotel Group and Wynn Macau & Wynn Palace), *1 producer* (Aquatechnologies Asia) and *1 associate* (Tasting Kitchen).
- HKSSC has received the Letter of Commitment from 13 members. A friendly reminder was given to the members who have not yet submitted the document.
- Wing Sang is no longer an HKSSC member because the company no longer operates seafood-related businesses. Qwehli also left the coalition due to marketing budget limitations and only sourcing two seafood species.
- HKSSC engaged 9 companies in Q1 and Q2 2022 and gained a network of restaurants through our World Oceans Day campaign in June 2022. Member recruitment will be a major focus for the remaining half of 2022 with the support of O&C WG members.

5. New member - Tasting Kitchen

- Mark Hammons, the Founder of Tasting Kitchen, gave an introduction to all members about Tasting Kitchen.
 - A premier epicurean lifestyle magazine in Asia, featuring world culture, wellness, art, culinary experience and luxury travel.
 - It has been distributed in multiple cities across Asia such as Hong Kong, Macau, Beijing and Shanghai. Its reach is to be expanded across Greater China.
 - TK's creative team travels to different countries to bring the local cultures of countries in the Middle East, Europe, South Africa and beyond, to their readers through spectacular images and expert writing.
 - TK has an extensive follower base on WeChat, Weibo and Facebook.
 - TK is published every two months as bilingual issues in English and Simplified Chinese.



- TK will cover seafood sustainability in its upcoming publication in response to the call of HKSSC's World Oceans Day Campaign in June 2022, and to highlight the urgency of adopting a new lifestyle that leads to a healthier ocean.
- Ocean Table is the hub where TK collaborates with international chefs, brands and hospitality industry leaders, etc.

6. Secretariat change

- New Secretariat: Mandy Wong, Programme Manager of ADM Capital Foundation, now oversees the Choose Right Today initiative and will be the Secretariat for the remainder of the year.

7. Member survey updates

- This survey was initiated in April 2022. Its goals are to identify common species, take stock of the significance of the HKSSC membership and identify common challenges amongst membership. HKSSC has received responses from 6 members who are suppliers, distributors and a hotel group.
- Most of the respondents consider Hong Kong to be their primary market. They source a great variety of species, mainly wild caught, from 10 to 120 species, and sell and purchase 10-150 tons of seafood in one year. The hotel group mainly sources farmed species.
- All respondents claim to know the catch areas of both wild caught and farmed species. Most of the respondents felt they are making good progress on implementing the Voluntary Code of Conduct. One felt very little progress.
- Only two respondents are sending the supplier data collection tools to suppliers.
- Technical adviser reiterated the purpose of setting up Supplier Data Collection Tools. It is to support the implementation of the Voluntary Codes of Conduct and help members understand the risks associated with their seafood sourcing.
- Respondents to the survey mentioned several reasons for not sending the tools to suppliers. One of them relies on official data from government regarding sustainability and certification. Another commented their suppliers are already compliant with the company's supplier code of conduct. The lack of time and human resources and the complexity of the supply chain were other reasons stated.
- Respondents to the survey mentioned more support is needed in assisting data collection from suppliers including human resources, a more simplified data collection process, and identification of priority species for data collection.
- Only two members have filled in the species identification spreadsheet.
- Technical Adviser highlighted the importance of data provision in order to identify common species traded amongst HKSSC members and volumes traded as a coalition. The feedback from Indoguna Lordly was shared with members - it was not time consuming to complete the spreadsheet as data is already available.
- Other members are encouraged to fill in the survey, and reiterated that all answers are to be aggregated so no individual company is identified.
- Technical Adviser highlighted the benefits of completing the survey. The species identification spreadsheet can potentially be used as a more simplified data collection tool as a first step for suppliers.
- Once the result is ready, HKSSC can focus on risk assessments and improvement projects for species commonly traded among members.



8. Working groups updates

- Technical Adviser introduced the members and the Chairs of the HKSSC working groups (WG) - Seafood Risks Assessment (SRA), Outreach & Communications (O&C) and Marketplace.

Seafood Risk Assessment Working Group

- Cesar Maresville, the Chair of SRA WG, shared an update on progress to date.
- SRA website and species profiles allow the supply chain to determine whether they can source a species or not with a flexible approach.
- Brings significant supply chain / industry knowledge and networks.
- Provides direction on what to be asking suppliers (supplier questions section).
- Aims to fill the gap in information that is not easily available.
- Aims to remain a rapid assessment (~6 days) and as affordable as possible.
- Recent addition of further species to the SRA website:
 - Uploaded five out of ten new species
 - Updated the profiles of tuna species
 - Updated profiles for Giant Grouper, LCT, spiny lobster and swordtip squid based on peer review feedback.
- Information available on website is considered valuable - more species are needed but this will take time.
- New addition this year – to add supplier contact details for low risk species
- Initial stages of an aquaculture improvement project (AIP) in Hong Kong ongoing for grey mullet.
- WG includes discussions on member risk assessments (M&C and Indoguna Lordly taking a lead)
- The focus going forward:
 - Chinese cuisine species
 - Identifying common species across members to move from research to action
- The Chair encouraged members, particularly suppliers, to join the WG
- The SRA ratings outcomes of 2022:
 - Three sea cucumber species (wild)
 - *Holothuria fuscogilva* (Australia – low risk)
 - *Stichopus japonicus* (Japan – medium risk)
 - *Holothuria tubulosa* (Turkey, Algeria, Morocco – all high risk)
 - Sweetwater fish (wild) – *Arapaima gigas* (Brazil - community-based management areas only – low risk)
 - Soft-shell mud crab (wild) - *Scylla serrata* (Indonesia, Thailand and Bangladesh – all medium risk)
 - Antarctic toothfish (wild) - *Dissostichus mawsoni* (Southern Ocean - outside the Ross Sea – medium risk)
 - Soft-shell mud crab (farmed) - *Scylla serrata* (Indonesia, Thailand and Bangladesh – all high risk)
 - Pearl oysters (farmed) - *Pinctada fucata* (Hong Kong – low risk)
 - Noble scallops (farmed) - *Mimachlamys nobilis* (Hong Kong – low risk)

Outreach & Communications Working Group

- Makiko Karasawa, the Chair of O&C WG, shared the success of the World Oceans Day campaign which can be further expanded next year.



- HKSSC had several discussions with MSC China who supported our campaign.
- More than 30 high-end restaurants and food service brands joined the campaign solely through our membership contacts. All restaurants showcased a sustainable seafood menu for the week of the UN World Oceans Day (6 – 12 June). Given that the majority of the participants are non-members, this campaign can be strategically used to have wider influence. Suppliers came across an increase in demand for sustainable products from chefs.
- WOD campaign next year can target fast food restaurants to bring it down to street level to avoid becoming elitist.
- The press release of the campaign was circulated in English and Chinese to over 200 media contacts. It was featured on different magazines and blogs including [Honeycombers Hong Kong](#), [Ming Pao Weekly](#), [BAP](#) blog, [Seafood Source](#), and the [official UN World Oceans Day website](#)
- There were 29 Instagram posts under #HKSSCWorldOceansDay by Nosh, Sands China, Mandarin Oriental, the Arcane Collective, The Mira Hong Kong, KIN Food Halls and Lobster Shack, etc. An [informative Blog](#) was published on Choose Right Today which reached over 6,323 audience.
- Wynn Palace and Wynn Macau promoted sustainable seafood for the month of June in 8 additional restaurants.
- FSAPME that owns Indoguna Lordly arranged events in 6 countries throughout June.
- Mandarin Oriental raised funds for HK Shark Foundation.
- HKSSC teamed up with SSC (UK) and Global Tuna Alliance on campaign to increase regulations on the high seas (BBNJ).
- Member recruitment has also been a major focus of the WG. WG members have helped to connect Secretariat and TA to prospective members.
- The Chair thinks it is more impactful when members themselves can join the calls, and encourages all members to actively make introductions and / or join the O&C WG. Given the scale of Hong Kong's retailers, it is very important to have them on board.
- A promotional video produced this year was actively used for recruitment discussions but it needs further promoting on social media with member logos included.
- HKSSC LinkedIn page has 375 followers. There were 45 new joiners since WOD campaign. The posts on LinkedIn page are mostly about IUU issues and sustainability news. All members are encouraged to post industry news and use the hashtag #HKSustainableSeafoodCoalition (#HKSSC) to increase engagement.
- Member support tools and product trials continue. The discussions within the WG are considered useful as they give rise to challenges members are facing and as a group to discuss solutions.
- PAS 1550 (international guidance on IUU and human rights) has been trialed by Indoguna and there is a great opportunity for members to get involved in Phase 2.
- The Chair encouraged all members to join the WG.
- TA provided an update on the Minderoo Foundation policy research to map out regulatory requirements and gaps in Hong Kong:
 - Project funding was secured in Feb 2022
 - Expected to be completed by ~July 2023
 - Ongoing data collection from Census & Statistics Dept. – HS Codes almost doubled in the past 10 years
 - Legal review and benchmark underway against other countries (China, Indonesia, Europe, US and Japan)
 - Market survey for industry is in development. Technical adviser encouraged all members to participate in the market survey.



Marketplace Working Group

- Cesar Maresville, the Chair of the WG, shared an update on progress to date.
- This initiative was launched in 2018 by the Peninsula and Teng Hoi given the need for a new tool in the marketplace. Trusted Seafood Platform is currently at the developing phase.
- It is to provide a platform for buyers and sellers to get access to sustainable seafood.
- It is based on the concept of reverse auctions to achieve a fair product sourcing. Suppliers can then approach chefs or buyers with the corresponding seafood species.
- The information shown on the platform will address traceability, legality and mislabelling of seafood including:
 - Name of the product and suppliers that provide that seafood;
 - Catching or farming method and area;
 - Name of the vessel;
 - Certification of the seafood product.
- A rating system for the supplier will be based on level of information provided.
- The Chair explained the workflow of the platform.
- From previous presentations, chefs and potential buyers suggested hosting other food products moving forward and advancing the security of the platform.
- The initiative is looking for an external body to audit the information provided by the suppliers.
- The initiative is recruiting buyers to test the platform and meeting funders to drive the platform forward.

9. Global Dialogue on Seafood Traceability and digitization

- The presentation video recorded by Maggie Lee, Asia Pacific Lead in Global Seafood Traceability of WWF, could not be played in the meeting due to technical issues. It will be circulated to members thereafter.
- Any member interested to speak further with Maggie Lee to please notify the TA / Secretariat.
- Huw Thomas, Steering Committee member, gave a brief introduction about the Global Dialogue on Seafood Traceability (GDST) and highlighted the importance of digitalising seafood trade data.
 - A B2B platform established in 2017, facilitated by WWF and the Institute of Food Technologists;
 - Set up global industry standards for seafood traceability and launched in March 2020, the standard was slightly revised this year;
 - Includes software providers;
 - Aim to get a common language across the industry, facilitate communication and improve the verifiability of information.

10. Biodiversity Beyond National Jurisdiction campaign

- Oliver Tanqueray, the Sustainable Seafood Coalition (SSC) Coordinator of ClientEarth in the UK, introduced the Biodiversity Beyond National Jurisdiction (BBNJ) agreement and the campaign.
- BBNJ is a legally-binding instrument that focuses on the conservation of biodiversity in marine areas beyond national jurisdictions.
- It is an important piece of UN regulations that has been under discussion for 15 years.



- BBNJ campaign initiated by SSC and the Global Tuna Alliance (GTA)
 - A collaboration between the UK SSC, the HKSSC and the GTA;
 - Organised meetings with influential decision-makers;
 - Organised official side-event at the UN Ocean Conference with high-level speakers;
 - Gave presentation to EU Markets Advisory Council;
 - Ongoing social media campaign;
 - Direct communications with relevant delegations.

11. Membership fee collection updates

- After 3 years of discussion, a fee structure came into effect in January 2022.
- Some members might be financially distressed due to COVID-19 impacts thus a flexible approach has been adopted.
- 9 members have paid their fees and currently at HKD119,000; Projected to raise HKD184,000 from membership this year.
- Grace period will end in July.
- Payment hiatus can be implemented if needed for new members.

Corporate member categories	Annual fee (HKD)
Organisations with 250+ employees	\$ 25,000
Organisations with between 50 - 249 employees	\$ 10,000
Organisations with 10 - 49 employees	\$ 8,000
Organisations with 9 or fewer employees	\$ 5,000
Associate members categories	Annual fee
Organisation with 250+ employees	\$ 10,000
Organisation with fewer than 250 employees	\$ 5,000
University	\$ 10,000
School	\$ 5,000

12. Proposed allocation of funds for 2023

- HKSSC needs a full time Secretariat who could potentially manage all aspects of the HKSSC – including operational, recruitment and technical.
- ADMCF has supported HKSSC with a part-time Secretariat. Unfortunately as an NGO ADMCF cannot solely provide support.
- With a full time Secretariat, an increase in recruitment with the support of members should be expected. With more financial support from member recruitment, HKSSC can deliver more work.
- WOD Campaign to be potentially coordinated through Choose Right Today.
- Sophie Le Clue also encouraged members to take up the Secretariat role, as another option.

13. News and resources



- The Chinese translation for the following documents is now available on Member Portal, including HKSSC introductory deck, VCoC step-by-step guide, Sector specific challenges - recommendations, and Member support tool.
- Secretariat to circulate dedicated links to these documents following the meeting.
- HKSSC promotional video is also available in both [English](#) and [Chinese](#).
 - It is actively used in recruitment meetings but still waiting for one more member logo confirmation before publishing on social media.
 - Member suggested HKSSC to go ahead with the promotional video without their logo, and explained the delay was due to their internal policy.
 - George Woodman, Steering Committee member, proposed publishing an updated version of video once more members confirmed the use of their logos.
- Several external presentations this year are available on request:
 - Presentation at The Harbour School - Renee L. and Stan S.
 - Sustainable Finance Initiative - Joshua W. (Peninsula) and Jacqui D. (TA)
 - Sustainable Seafood Master Class at Wynn Macau (Cantonese) - Stan S.
 - Green Hospitality event - Samantha D.M. (KIN Food Halls) and George W. (SC)
- [Sector Standard for Agriculture, Aquaculture, and Fishing](#) - Global Reporting Initiative standard for the industry is now available. If any member is interested in using the standard for their annual reporting, they can reach out to the TA for any clarifications.

14. Any other business

- Cesar Maresville suggested a quick overview on the meeting with WWF last week. HKSSC is seeking collaboration opportunities with WWF given some members are involved with both HKSSC and WWF programmes.
- Sophie Le Clue (SC) mentioned WWF focuses more on sustainability but less on traceability and legality. From HKSSC perspective, we would like to work with WWF moving forward and leverage each other's work. An internal HKSSC meeting regarding this matter will be held on 29 July.
- Iris Lam (Mandarin Oriental) suggested bringing up ideas explicitly to facilitate constructive discussion. Aside from sharing materials publicly, members deserve more acknowledgment of engaging with the HKSSC.
- Sophie Le Clue reiterated the importance of SRA which provides more information (open access) for seafood species in terms of risks. She invited all members to join the internal meeting on 29 July.